HARROGATE BOROUGH COUNCIL

PLANNING AREA2 DC COMMITTEE - AGENDA ITEM 6: LIST OF PLANS.

DATE: 19 July 2005

PLAN: 12 **CASE NUMBER:** 05/01855/FUL

GRID REF: EAST 434445 **NORTH** 457910

Knaresborough Scriven

APPLICATION NO. 6.94.40.E.FUL **DATE MADE VALID:** 16.05.2005

TARGET DATE: 11.07.2005

Park

APPLICANT: Hospital & Medical Care Association

AGENT: Dossor Group

PROPOSAL: Demolition of existing garages, erection of triple garage with flat above and

WARD:

felling of various Holly trees forming a hedge within the Scriven

Conservation Area.

LOCATION: Scriven Park Ripley Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 9DF

REPORT

SITE AND PROPOSAL

The site comprises part of the site known as Scriven Park at Ripley Road Knaresborough. The main building within the site is used for offices. The site lies within the conservation area and an area of special landscape. The site is set in a secluded area surrounded by trees and shrubs and there is a stone wall approximately 1.8m to 2m high along the road frontage. There are a significant amount of trees/shrubs within and around the perimeter of the site and the office building and existing triple garage adjacent to the offices are not visible from High Bond End/Ripley Road. The site lies close to the urban area of Knaresborough but is within the open countryside. There are a number of large detached houses immediately opposite the site.

The proposal is to erect a replacement triple garage with flat above on the site of the existing triple garages and the felling of an existing group of holly trees which forms a hedge. The proposed garage and flat would be constructed of brick and artificial slate. The applicant's agent has indicated in a letter accompanying the application that the flat "is necessary in order to assist with the security of the site out of office hours." The applicant has also submitted a letter dated 23 June 2005 and accompanying information regarding crime activity at Scriven Park in support of the application. A copy of this is attached at Appendix 1. The existing flat roof triple garage is constructed of precast concrete and corrugated sheeting and is currently used for storage and parking vehicles. The applicant's agent has amended the design of the roof to improve the appearance of the garage/flat.

MAIN ISSUES

- 1. Principle. Housing in the Countryside.
- 2. Conservation Area and Special Landscape Area.
- 3. Highays.
- 4. Open Space.

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

Change of use of the building on the site to offices approved 4 March 1986 which is currently still used by the applicant as offices. Demolition of garages and erection of garage and storage block and felling of trees/hedge approved 24 November 2003. Not implemented. Erection of 1.2m high metal railings on top of boundary wall refused 23 May 2005 on the grounds of detrimental impact on the conservation area. The applicant applied for this on the grounds that the metal fence was required for security reasons.

CONSULTATIONS/NOTIFICATIONS

Parish Council

Scriven

Chief Engineer (H and T)

Recommends approval.

DLAS - Open Space

Commuted sum for £125.00 for open space allocated to Jacob Smith Park.

Yorkshire Water

From the information supplied observations are not required.

Environment Agency

No comments on this proposal.

Environmental Health

No objections.

D.L.A.S Arboricultural Officer

Removal of holly hedge will not be detrimental to the area.

APPLICATION PUBLICITY

SITE NOTICE EXPIRY: 01.07.2005 PRESS NOTICE EXPIRY: 01.07.2005

REPRESENTATIONS

PARISH COUNCIL - No objections.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS - None.

VOLUNTARY NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATION - None.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

- PPS1 Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Communities
- LPA01 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy A1: Impact on the Environment and Amenity
- LPHD20 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD20: Design of New Development and Redevelopment
- LPC09 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy C9: Special Landscape Areas
- LPH07 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H7: Housing development in the countryside
- PPG15 Planning Policy Guidance 15: Planning and the Historic Environment
- LPHD03 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD3: Control of development in Conservation Areas

ASSESSMENT OF MAIN ISSUES

1. PRINCIPLE. HOUSING IN THE COUNTRYSIDE - In terms of the principle of a new dwelling/flat on the site Policy H7 is relevant in the determination of this application. This Policy states, inter alia, that: "The erection of new dwellingswill be permitted where there is a special justification."

It is clear from the information submitted with the application that the applicant's office/business use has suffered from security problems over the years and it would appear that this is a continuing problem because the site is secluded and not visible from the public domain. This matter is a relevant material consideration in the determination of an application but it is not the overriding consideration. It is concluded that on the basis of the information submitted that there is no special justification for departing from the established policy in this particular case although it is recognised that Members are entitled to attach some weight to the applicant's case in reaching their decision. However it is accepted that the determination of the application is a balanced decision and that Members are entitled to reach a different judgement on this application if they consider that there is a justification for departing from the policy in this case.

2. CONSERVATION AREA AND SPECIAL LANDSCAPE AREA - In considering proposals which affect a conservation area the Local Planning Authority is required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of the conservation area.

The plans as originally submitted indicated a large dormer to the front and rear of the flat and it is considered that this design does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area. Therefore the application as originally submitted cannot be supported in terms of the impact on the conservation area.

The applicant's agent has however amended the design of the roof. The large dormer at the front has been deleted and replaced by two conservation roof lights. The hipped roof has been amended to a ridge roof. The large dormer to the rear has also been deleted and replaced with a duo-pitch roof construction and gable wall. The amended plans are an improvement on the original submission and it is considered that the proposal would

preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area. Therefore the design of the garage and flat is considered to be acceptable and will therefore not conflict with Policies A1, HD20 and HD3

The proposal involves the removal of a number of holly trees, which form a hedge adjacent to the existing garage, but no other trees in the area are affected by the development. It should be noted that an earlier application for a replacement garage was approved in November 2003 and this included the removal of these holly trees. The Council's Arboricultural officer has stated that the removal of the holly hedge will not be detrimental to the area. The proposal does not conflict with Policy C9. Therefore no objections are raised on the grounds of loss of trees.

- 3. HIGHWAYS The Highway Officer has recommended approval and therefore there are no highway reasons to oppose the application.
- 4. OPEN SPACE The applicant has signed the unilateral undertaking in relation to the provision of open space within the area and the development is therefore in accordance with Policy R4.

The proposed development would however be contrary to Policy H7.

CONCLUSION - It is recommended that the application be refused.

CASE OFFICER: Phil Jewkes

RECOMMENDATION

That the application be REFUSED. Reason(s) for refusal:-

It is considered that the applicant's submitted evidence in terms of criminal incidents in relation to the business on the site is not sufficient justification to depart from the Council's established policy in relation to housing development within the countryside. The proposal would therefore be contrary to Policy H7 of the Harrogate District Local Plan.

